THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : They are addressing the Chair. Because we cannot hear anything. Let me read out the letter of the Prime Minister. He says, "I will be presiding over the "Education for AH" conference tomorrow, Thursday, December 16. 1993."—It was written yesterday.—"I would, therefore be compelled to absent myself from tht sitting of the House. I am requesting my colleague, the Minister of State concerned, to attend to the questions pertaining to the Ministries/Departments in my direct charge doring the Question Hour." Now this is the letter . . *(Interruptions)* . . Just one second, when the Minsi-ter of Commerce comes—because he already committed in the Lok Sabha and as they do not have any clarifications, he will be free earlier—as soon as he comes here, he will make a statement. Whatever questions you want to put, you can put to him. Let us go ahead with the Question Hour.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, there is one point. One point. Yesterday . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH: No point. No point, Madam. . . . *(Interruptions)* ... If you are going to allow him. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : On that point I will allow. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH : This is not the way. This is not the way. . . . *(Interruptions)* . .. Why are you going to allow him ? First, you allow me. ... *(InterruptionsQ* . .. No, this is not the way. Because he has just ... *(Interruptions)* ...

उपसभापति : बैठिये । डिस्टरबेंस होती है, मैं सुन नहीं पाती हूं (व्यवधान) मि० स्वामी आप बोलिये।

SHRI SHANKAR DAYAL SINGH : No, no. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, yesterday, what the Minister of State for Commerce stated . . . *(Interruption)* . Whatever tht statement, there was a deadline—yesterday night—for signing the Draft. And they signed it. Why couldn't they ask the Prime Minister yesterday ? . . . *(Interruptions)* ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Now, that matter is over Q. 201. ... *(.Interruptions)* . ..

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, he has been allowed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I did not allow him and I am hot allowing,

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA : Madam, I want to know why the Government has signed the document.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, I am not allowing. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

Q. 201. . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Sit down . .. *(Interruptions)* . . . Now, please sit down. Question Hour.

*201. *[The Questions (Shri Ramdas Agarwal and Shri Sunder Singh Bhandari) were absent, for answer* vide *col.... infra.]*

*202. *[The Questioner (Shri Sushil Kumar Sambhajirao Shinde) was absent. For ans wer vide Col .....infra.]*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Q. 203 . . . *(Interruption)* ... He is also Absent-minded *(Interruption* . . . Absent-minded Not absent.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : His mind is absent with a break.

Performance of the Bhel Turbine Generators Supplied to Atomic Power Plant*

*203 DR. BAPU KALDATE :†

SMT. KAMLA SINHA :

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to refer to the answer to Unstarred Question 2 given to the Rajya Sabha on the 2nd December, 1993 and state :

(a) how the performance of those Atomic Power Plants which are supplied with turbine generators by the BHEL is rated

†The Question was actually asked on the floor of the House by—DR. BAPU KALDATE

as odmpared to the performance of the Atomic Power Plants operating with turbine generators supplied by foreign companies ; and

(b) the loss suffered by these power plants due to the unsatisfactory performance of the BHEL turbine generators ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENTS OF ATOMIC ENERGY AND SPACE WITH ADDITIONAL CHARGE OF MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECH-NOLOGY (SHRI BHUVNESH CHATUR-VEDI) : (a) and (b) Madam, on an over-afl basis, the performance of the Atomic-Power Plants with imported Turbine Generators . . . *(Interruption)* . . .

AN HON. MEMBER : Madam, he is reading it. A statement is laid on the Table of the Mouse.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Okay. I can manage it. If he has laid it, I will tell him not to read . . . *(Interruptions)*. . . Dpn't interfere.

SMRI BHUNESH CHATURVED1 : (a) Madam, on an overall basis, the performance of the Atomic Power Plants with imported Turbine Generators (TGs) at Tarafmr and second unit at Rajasthan has been better than that of the Narora and Madras Atomic Power Stations equipped with indigenous TGs. The performance of the first unit at Rajasthsn, though equipped with imported turbine, has not been satrsfactory the performance of the TGs at Nafora and Madras as also of the new stations under construction is expected to be better in future.

(b) In view of the inter-play of a number of factors, which Effect Bue performance of a power station including the condition of the grid, it is difficult to quattity accurately the loss in generation due *to* deficiencies directly attributable to the turbine generators. However, the station down time due to the shortcomings of the Turbine Generators constitute a significant part of the loss of generation from the two units at Narora Atomic Power Station.

AN HON. MEMBER : Good. Well done for a maiden answer.

SHRI BAPU KALDATE: Well done for reading it out. Well done not tor the answer but well done in reading *it* iricply.
. . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

यह जो सवाल उपस्थित हुआ है वह हुआ है 31 मार्च 1993 को नरोरा में जो टरबाइन जनरेटर में आग लग गयी और एक बहुत बड़ा विस्फोट हुआ उसके आधार पर। जहां तक हमारी जानकारी है एटामिक एनर्जी रेगूलेटरी बोर्ड ने न्यूक्लियर पावर कारपोरेशन को इस की पूरी जांच करने के लिये कहा था। यह सारा सवाल उस पुराने सवाल पर आधारित है। इसमें आपने एक बात तो मान ली है कि जो मेल के टरबाईन जनरेटर्स हैं इससे तारापुर वाले और राजस्थान वाले में जो बाहर के टरबाईन जेनरेटर्स हैं उनका काम अच्छा है। भले ही आपने आगे लिखा है कि राजस्थान के टरबाईन जेनरेटर में भी आपत्तियां आ रही हैं। एक बात तो साफ है कि जो बाहर के इक्विपेंट वाले टरबाइन जेनरेटर्स हैं इनसे भेल का टरबाईन जेनरेटर ज्यादा अच्छा नहीं है। इसीलिए हम चाहते हैं कि जो आपने इन्वेस्टीगेशन आग और विस्फोट की कराई है इस आग और विस्फोट के इन्वेस्टीगेशन का क्या निर्णय है, क्या इंडीकेशन है। यह पहले हमको बता दें।

श्री भुवनेश चतुर्वेदी : माननीय महोदया, पहले भी इस प्रश्न को उठाया गया था। उसका जवाब दे दिया गया था। इंटरनेशनल स्टैंडर्ड से जो जांच होती है उसके आधार पर यह इन्सीडेंट की परिभाषा में आता है। इसका मतलब यह है कि गम्भीर एक्सीडेंट नहीं है। इंसीडेंट की परिभाषा में आता है और उसकी जांच की रिपोर्ट आ चुकी है। दो-दो जांच रिपोर्टस ब थी और दोनों जांच की रिपोर्टस आ चुकी हैं।

डा० बापू कालदाते : कुछ नहीं आया **(व्यवधान)** उनके जवाब में मुझे कुछ नहीं मिला, न सदन को कुछ मिला होगा (व्यवधान)

श्री भुवनेश चतुर्वेदी : मैं निवेदन कर रहा हूं कि उस रिपोर्ट के आधार पर वह इन्सीडेंट की परिभाषा में आता है। वह जो भी है वह एक्सीडेंट की परिभाषा में नहीं आता। इसलिए वह गम्भीर इन्सीडेंट नहीं है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : It is not a serious accident.

डा० बापू कालदाते : इससे क्या मतलब समझें कि एक्सीडेंट नहीं है, इन्सीडेंट है। शब्द इधर उधर करने से तो कोई फर्क नहीं पड़ता है। आग तो लग गयी विस्फोट तो हो गया। यह आग और विस्फोट जिस किसी कारण से हुआ हो, इन्सीडेंट हुई हो या विस्फोट हो या एक्सीडेंट हुआ हो इसका कोई इन्वेस्टीगेशन करने के लिए आपने कहा था। इस इन्वेस्टीगेशन से आपको क्या इंडीकेशन्स, क्या जानकारी मिली यह तो हमको बतायें। यह पहला क्वैश्चन है। अभी तक पहला चल रहा है।

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Accidently it happens to be the first question.

श्री भुवनेश चतुर्वेदी : जैसा मैंने माननीय सदस्य को निवेदन किया कि जो जांच हो चुकी है और जांच की रिपोर्ट आ चुकी है उसके आधार पर वह गम्भीर घटना नहीं मानी जाती है लेकिन साधारण घटना मानी जाती है। लेकिन अब नरोरा प्लांट में क्या हो रहा है वह आपको मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूं :

Presently Narora Unit-1 is under extensive rehabilitation after the severe fire incident of March 31, 1993.

SHRI BAPU KALDATE : Not serious, severe.

SHRI BHUVANESH CHATURVEDI : Yes, it is severe. I agree. It is our international definition. You and I cannot help it. Narora Unit-I is expected to be started in the second quarter of 1994. Narora Unit-2 has already been restarted after carrying out nacessary modification.

डा० बापू कालदाते : इन्वेस्टीगेशन की जो इन्डीकेशन्स हैं वे मेरे पास है। मैं आपको बताना चाहता हूं कि ये इन्डीकेशन्स ऐसी थी कि टरबाईन जेनरेटर के ब्लेड्स फेल हो गये। लास्ट पार्ट आफ द टरबाइन में और भारी ब्लेड्स थे। इससे यह हो गया कि टरबाइन जेनरेटर में असमतोल हो गया, इम्बैलेंस हो गया और इस इम्बैलेंस के कारण जो वाइब्रेशन्स आ गये, उन वाइब्रेशन्स के कारण वहां विस्फोट हो गया। हाइड्रोजन लाते हैं कूलिंग के लिए पाइप से, ये पाइप फट गये और विस्फोट हो गया। अगर यह बात हो गयी फिर आपने आगे क्या-क्या किया सो अलग बात है लेकिन यह बात हो चुकी है और ये कारण भी है। अब उन्होंने नहीं कहा मुझे मालूम नहीं क्यों नहीं कहा। अगर उनके पास होता तो जरूर कहते। लेकिन यह हो गया। अब लासेज का सवाल उठता है। जहां तक लासेज की बात है आपके जवाब में इतना वेग आन्सर है उसका :

"In view of the interplay of a number of factors which affect the performance of a power station including the condition of the grid, it is difficult to quantify accurately the loss in generation due to deficiencies .."

और आखिर में यह कहा है कि हमारा सवाल इस पर निर्भर है कि जो कोई शार्टकमिंग्स, आपने लिखा है कि शार्टकमिंग्स आती हैं, उसके कारण स्टेशंस बंद हो जाते है, स्टेशंस बंद हो जाने से पावर नहीं मिलती और पावर नहीं मिलती है तो लॉस होता है। मेरा तो एक स्पेसिफिक प्रश्न है कि उस फायर या विस्फोट से जो नुकसान हुआ है वह कितने का हुआ है, इतना तो कम-से-कम बताइए ?

श्री भुवनेश चतुर्वेदी : मैडम, माननीय सदस्य का सवाल मुख्य तौर पर यह है कि भेल के द्वारा सप्लाय किए गए और इम्पोर्टेड टर्बाइंस/जनरेटरों में कितना फर्क है और उसकी क्या उपयोगिता

है, मुख्य सवाल यह है। मुख्य सवाल नरोरा प्लांट नहीं है, फिर भी आपके ... **(व्यवधान)** ...

डा० बापू कालदाते : आपने जवाब में कहा है कि

"Losses cannot be identified". It means losses are there.

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVED1 : Who denies it ?

लेकिन जैसा आपने कहा कि इनवेस्टीगेशन में टर्बाइन की प्लेट टूटने के कारण आग लगी, यह बात सही है और प्लेट में जो सुधार ... **(व्यवधान)**...

उपसभापति : जवाब तो देने दीजिए।

Let him answer

DR. BAPU KALDATE : My question was ... *(Interruptions)* ..

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Let him answer.

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI : I cannot say what the extent of damage is.

हालांकि सवाल आपका दूसरा है, लेकिन आप चाहेंगे कि कितना लॉस हुआ है तो वह मैं आपको निवेदन कर दूंगा और रिपोर्ट की कॉपी भी आपके पास भिजवा सकता हूं।

डा० बापू कालदाते : आप देखिए, नंबर दो में "The loss suffered by these power plants due to the unsatisfactory performance of the BHEL turbine generators ?" हमारा सवाल ही यह है। अब वह बोल ही नहीं रहे तो मैं क्या करूं!

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा : उपसभापति महोदया, मंत्रीजी का उत्तर बहुत ही असंतोषजनक है और मंत्री जी ने सफाई से जवाब नहीं दिया है। पता नहीं वे किन तथ्यों को छिपाना चाहते थे। मैं प्रश्न के दूसरे खंड के बारे में पूछना चाहूंगी हालांकि पहले और दूसरे प्रश्न मिले हुए ही हैं। मेरा प्रश्न यह होगा, यह सत्य है कि नरोरा में जो टर्बाइन लगे हुए थे वह बी०एच०ई०एल० के बनाए हुए थे और बी०एच०ई०एल० हमारे देश की एक प्राइम फैक्ट्री है जो कि हैवी इलेक्ट्रिकल इंजीनियरिंग का सामान बनाती है, तो किन-किन जगहों पर बी०एच०ई०एल० ने एटोमिक इनर्जी पावर स्टेशंस, मशीनरीज और टर्बाइंस सप्लाय किए हैं और क्या यह ही एकमात्र फेलुअर है या और कहीं भी हुआ है ? मैडम, मेरी जानकारी के मुताबिक और कहीं नहीं हुआ होगा है, तो यही किसी खास कारण से हुआ। इसलिए मैं मंत्री महोदय से जानना चाहती हूं कि बी०एच०ई०एल० के टैक्नीकल अपग्रेडेशन के लिए आपके पास कोई स्कीम है ?

श्री भुवनेश चतुर्वेदी : जी हां, माननीय सदस्या।

(Interruptions).

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Madam, the Chair cannot be a silent spectator. We expect the Chair to intervene. *(Interruptions).*

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA : He has not

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा : मैडम, मंत्रीजी अगर इसी तरह से जवाब देंगे तो हमारे प्रश्न पूछने का कोई मतलब ही नहीं है ? मैडम, यह प्रधान मंत्रीजी का विषय है, उनको आना चाहिए था या जिनको विषय की जानकारी है, ऐसे व्यक्ति को होना चाहिए था।

डा० बापू कालदाते : मैडम, आप खुद समझती होंगी इस सवाल के जवाब के बारे में। मैडम, मेरी प्रार्थना है कि इस पर आधे घंटे की बहस होनी चाहिए जो कि आवश्यक हो जाती है।

replied to my question. *(Interruptions).*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Just a minute. Your question was very specific. You asked, "Is he going to have a project to modernise, upgrade scientifically and technologically the BHEL so that such incidents do not occur in future? 'The Minister said, "Yes."

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA : The Minister should come out with a proper reply.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : The Minister said, "Yes".

SHRIMATI KAMLA SINHA : The Minister should come out with a detailed answer. What 'appropriate scheme does the Government have for BHEL so that such accidents do not occur in future ? What are the details ? The Minister should < come out With details.

उपसभापति : कमला सिन्हा जी, स्पेसिफिक सवाल है कि-है । अगर यह सवाल अब आगे कोई रखेगा कि- क्या है ? तो फिर जवाब देंगे । आपने पूछा है - "है" । उन्होंने कह दिया -"है" ।

श्रीमती कमला सिन्हा : मैडम, मैंने ही इस सवाल को पूछा था कि— "क्या है" । तो मंत्री जी का एक शब्द का उत्तर हुआ—"है" । क्या है, भाई ? कौन सी चिड़िया है ? यह तो बताइये आप । ... **(व्यवधान)** ...

उपसभापति : अभी, मिस्टर अशोक मित्रा ।

SHRI ASHOK MITRA : Madam, my question relates to the question which was asked by Mrs. Sinha, I want to pursue the sarh'e question. Obviously, there is a necessity for upgrading the technology of BHEL because there was a similar incident with the turbo-generator installed at Vendal in West Bengal. So in view of such isolated incidents and also the fact that all of us are Extremely proud of BHEL as a leading producer of power plants in the country, would be Government kindly take into consideration the necessity to upgrade BHEL and in this connection also stop to financing the import of power Plants from overseas ?

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI : I share the pride of the hon. Member that BHEL is an important national industry. But at. the same time I would like to submit that upgradation, reform and improvement of BHEL is being done and it is being taken up in a phased manner. We hope we shall be able to improve it further.

SHRI MD. SALIM : What about import of power generators ?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Mr. Salim, I have not identified you.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA.: How can it operate efficiently if you stop buying from BHEL and you buy from America and Switzerland ? What kind of policy is this ?

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : The Atomic Power Plant, Kalpakkam in Madras, has to be shut down for at least 3 months in a year. One unit had to be shut down because of a defect in the turbine installed there. We have been losing more than 235 megawatts of electricity because one unit had to be shut down. We take pride that an indigenously manufactured BHEL turbine has been installed there and it has been functioning efficiently. But it had to be shut down for obvious reasons—mainly on grounds of defect in the turbine. Therefore, I would like to know from the Minister whether an expert committee has been appointed to go into the details of why the plant had to be shut down. Not only is the Government losing revenue, but it is located in a danger prone area—near the sea shore. Therefore, I would like to know whether an expert committee has been appointed to go into the details and also to rectify the defect.

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI : We are conscious of the not-so-satisfactory working of the turbine. The Government is conscious of it and it is making enquiries. We will certainly improve upon it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Has an expert committee been appointed ?

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI : Not to my knowledge.

SHRI VITHALRAO MADHAVRAO JADHAV : The hon. Minister has stated that the accident was not of a very serious type. There seem to be two types of accidents from his reply. May I know the

definition of a serious type of accident ? After the Chernobyl incident, a detailed discussion took place in the Consultative Committee of Science and Technology when Shri Rajiv Gandhi was its Chairman. I think, Madam, you were also there. At that time it was decided that whatever be the power plants manufactured by BHEL, full care shall be taken. As pointed out by Mr. Bapu Kaldate, there was a serious fire accident. When there was a serious fire accident, the accident would have been a serious one. Madam, today, I come to know that India is exporting atomic power plants to some country, probably, Thailand. If some defects are there in the power plants which are being exported to other countries, it will defame our country. What measures or precautions has the BHEL taken to ensure that the equipments exported are of good quality ? I would like to know whether strict measures are being taken by them in this regard ? Then, the Minister must assure the House that, in future, such accidents or incidents, whether light or serious, will not take place because it is not economically or physically feasible to our country.

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI : Madam Deputy Chairman, I am unable to reply to one part of his question, that is, about exports of power reactors to Thailand because I have no information about it right now ; it requires notice. To his point, about definition, I would like to say that there are seven types of incidents and accidents. I will not be able to mention them just now. But, from my memory, I can tell you that we are guided by the definitions given by the Bttema-tional agencies Atomic Energy Agency.

SHRI DAYANAND SAHAY : Madam, a lot of confusion on this question can be clarified if the Minister can just tell us one thing, that is, whether the quality and the price of the equipment manufactured by BHEL are the same as those of the imported ones. If this is clarified, then there is no further confusion on this question, If BHEL can produce the same quality as that of the imported equipments, then the problem is over . . . *(Interruptions),*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : He has got it confused with Bhelpuri.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Mr. Swamy seems to be hurrgry.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY : He is trying to confuse the Minister,

SHRI DAYANANAD SAHAY : If the Minister says that the quality and the price of the equipments like turbines and generators are the same as those of the imported ones, then it will be clear.

SHRI KAMAL MORARKA : You are telling him how to justily the imports.

SHRI BHUVNESH CHATURVEDI : Madam Deputy Chairman, I am not chiming that they are of the same, quality. I am not claiming it. I am only saying that there are certain deficiencies which we are rectifying because self-relinnee: : is our motto.

SHRIMATI RENUKA CHOWDHURY: Have you asked for technological transfer ?

204. *[Transferred to 21st December,* 1993.1

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Question No. 205 . . . *(Inttrmptions).*

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Madam, in the question paper, my question is there and without my knowledge ... *(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please, if the Members want to talk, t*dey* should go closer or they Should go out. He has put a question and let me hear it.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY-; Without my knowledge, without informing me, I have been, at the last minute, told that question has been transferred; No this is a question which, according to me, stricst-ly belongs to the Industry Ministry.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Are *you* referring to Question No. 204 ?

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : Yes, which has now been skipped and you are passing on to Question No, 205.

THE CHAIRMAN : It has been trans ferred.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY : But there is a procedure. Question Hour is the privilege of the Members. We are not illiterates. We know which Ministry has to answer what. If there is any fundamental difference of opinion, We should at least be told in advance. We file these questions 15-20 days in advance and then, suddenly, we find them tansferred. We don't think that the Finance Ministry can answer this question. At least, this matter should have been brought to our notice. I do not know whether this was brought to your notice or not, but certainly we were taken aback. I came here prepared for the question only to learn that it has been transferred. I don't think the Secretariat should function in this manner ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : No, it is not the Secretariat . . . *{Interruptions)* Mr. Jagesh Desai, let me answer . . . *(Interruptions)* .

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : My question is also clubbed with this.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am saying the same thing. You don't have to waste the time Of the House. Let me first reply .. . *(Interruptions)*

SHRI CHIMANBHAI MEHTA : The question is that we should have been informed.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : Your supplementary is being accepted. Now, I must inform the two Members, Shri Chimanbhai Mehta and Shri Subramanian Swamy, that it is not the mistake of the Secretariat. The Secretariat sends the questions tabled by the Members to the concerned Ministry. It is between the Ministries that one Ministry transfers a question and the other Ministry accepts it. I will read it out for your information. We will change the procedure if the Membeits so want. This was addressed to one Mr. Singh. It says :

"Please refer to your letter dated 6th December enclosing a copy of the Rajya Sabha Secretariat Starred Question No, DY5035 for reply on 16-12-1993 regarding Goswami Committee Report. Since the subject matter of the question pertains to this division, we have no objection in accepting the transfer of the question."

This reply was given by one Shri D. R. S. Chowdhury. This reply came and the Secretariat showed it to me. But I feel that—I share with your concern—when they transfer a question from one Ministry to the other, it is necessary for them to inform the Member concerned why they are transferring the question and the reasons therefor and not just transfer the question with out informing the Secretariat and, through the Secretariat, the Member concerned. I hope in future the procedure would be like this.

SHRI SUBRAMANIAN SWAMY: Madam, there should be some consultation with the Member. After all, I hoped that the Industry. Ministry would be forced to answer the question and some embarrassing answers would have come. This transfer, in my opinion, is a *mala fide* transfer.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : I am not concerned with what answers would have come. I am only concerned with the reasons why a question is transferred.

SHRI JAGESH DESAI : Madam, it really belongs to the Finance Ministry because in regard to sick industries, the Finance Ministry and the IDBI are concerned . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . So, to say *mala fide* is not . . . *(Interruptions)* . . .

THE DEPUTY CHAIRAN : Does it belong to the Finance Ministry ?

SHRI JAGESH DESAI: Yes, it belongs to the Finance Ministry.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN : There is no argument . . . *(Interruptions)* . . . Now, please don't cross-talk. Let the Finance Ministry or the Industry Ministry inform. Now I will go to Question No. 205.

*205. *[The Questioner (Shrimati Chandrika Abhinandan Jain) was absent. For Answer Vide (Col, .., infra)* ..